1944-47 **File No.** 7191/36 I

B CLASS Public Works **DEPARTMENT**

E **BRANCH**

Subject:— Reorganization ..

Public Health Branch

Raising the status of the C.P.H.E to

that of a S.E. and creation of two

Divisional charges under him——

V

B/K/47

E:

File No. 7191/36-I

Ed. Sectt. Slip 91 A

G R., G D., No. 2408, dated 22-6-22.]

Correspondence

DOCKET SHEET (B)

Subject :—

File No. 7191/36-I

P. W. DEPT.

E. BRANCH.

References :—

Date.	To whom sent.	Notes and instructions.

Confidential.

D.O.No.C/2446 of 1944.
Office of the
Consulting Public Health
Engineer to Government,
Poona, March 6th 1944.

Dear Desai,

Subject:-Reconstruction
Post War Works.

In response to your D.O.No.9681-I-39 (Revenue Department) dated the 5th February 1944, I submit herewith two statements and five appendices detailing all information about staff required for planning and execution of Public Health Schemes as Post-War-Reconstruction measure. You will find all your questions answered in them.

2. As per Government orders I have included schemes costing only above 5 lakhs but there are many a mofussil towns which every badly require the amenities of life (water supply and drainage), the collective cost of the remaining schemes will amount to about 3 crores. This will be additional to that included in the statement.

3. I believe this will materially help us to the tide of discussion at the meeting to be held on 8th inst.

4. Please show this letter and proposals to the Secretary to Government, Revenue Department.

Yours Sincerely,

Id/-

D.A.2 statements
5 appendices.

To

M.J.Desai, Esquire, I.C.S.,
Deputy Secretary to Govt.
Revenue Department, Bombay.

...

Copy forwarded with compliments for information to the Secretary to Government, Public Works Department, Bombay.

(E.B.)

Submitted for information and orders, if any.

2. In the Joint note of Secys, no separate provision has been made for Estbt. for planning and preparing P.H. projects. The provision suggested in the Joint note for the execution of P.H. works is as follows:-

3 Ex. Engrs.
6 Dy. Engrs.
36 Overseer.

Plus adde. office estbt.

3. The estbt. proposed by the C.P.H.E. for planning and execution of P.W.R. projects will be found at P. 1 ante. This estbt. is much in excess of that proposed in the Joint note.

Id/- G.R.
3-4-44

Id/-
3-4-44.

through M.B. & P.W.R. Bch.

P.W.R.B.

4. In the particulars pertaining to the Post War Reconstruction Programme relating to the P.W.D. furnished to the E.D. on 21-3-44 for communication to the G. of I. it has been proposed that works costing Rs. 146 lakhs in the aggregate will be carried out in the 1st 5 year period and that works costing Rs. 284 lakhs in the aggregate will be done in the 2nd five year period.

Id/-
4-4-44

Id/-
10-4

For execution the provision made in the joint note would probably be adequate on the avarage. For the first 5 years two Divisions would be required. (there being only two big works). During the second 5 years, scattered works have to be executed and perhaps, 4 Divisions may be required.

For planning no provision for any extra est. has been made in the joint note. In order to verify how far the requirements of the C.P.H.E. are justified it is necessary to know at what stage each of the project in the P.W.R. programme is, will the M.B. please submit brief notes emplaining how the projects stand.

Id/-
10-4-44

M.B.

Position of the several projects is as stated below:-

(1) <u>Neergnagar Water Supply Scheme for Dharwar and Hubli.</u>- Detailed plans and estimates the latter amounting to Rs.83,22,283 net for the scheme submitted by the C.P.H.E. to Govt. have been refd. back to that officer with G.L.No.6250/36-M, dated the 21-1-44, for clarification of certain points. The C.P.H.E's reply is awaited. The scheme is proposed to be carried out as a Govt. scheme.

(2) <u>Belgaum Water Supply Scheme.</u> - This scheme is to be so designed as to meet the requirements of the Belgaum Muny. and the other bodies (including the mily. and the/ Muny.) The plans and estimates received from the C.P.H.E. to Govt. have been returned to him for compliance with the above requirement and for recasting the estimates to suit the present conditions. - vide G.L. No.B.P.H.W. 32-M, dated

dated the 14-1-44. The scheme is to be undertaken as a Govt.scheme.

(3) Ahmednagar Water Supply Infiltration Plant.- The work has been approved administratively for Rs.1,43,583. The project has been revised and the revised cost amount to Rs.5,04,614. The Ahmednagar Muny. has however resolved to postpone the scheme during war conditions.

(4) Salsette Water Supply.- The scheme has been estimated to cost Rs.66,01,385 nett in 1938. Its further consideration has been postponed pending the settlement of the question of "Greater Bombay" and also because the water supply already available in the suburbs is sufficient for the present requirements. The scheme is a Govt. one.

(5) Surat Drainage.- This is a Municipal scheme The project has been administratively approved for Rs.53,09,000. It is to be financed by raising a loan. The Muny. does not intend to proceed with it during the period of war and ~~mk~~ to raise the loan required.

(6) Surat Water Supply Distribution. - This is Muni. scheme. The project has been completed and sent to the Muny. The Muny's acceptance of the scheme and its proposals for financing are awaited. The project is estimated to Cost Rs. 5,80,000.

(7) Pandharpur Water Supply Distribution System.- The Pandharpur Water Works are Govt. owned water works. Govt. have decided to postpone construction of the scheme until after the war. The estimated cost is Rs.3,30,183. The detailed plans and estimate have not been prepared.

(8) Kharakwasla Scheme for Poona & Kirkee. - The scheme is estimated to cost Rs.46,00,000.

The scheme has neither been administratively approved nor the plans and estimates therefor technically sanctioned. The scheme is proposed to be taken up as Govt. scheme.

(9) Nipani Water Supply Scheme. - This is a Munl. scheme. Only the Survey estimate for this work has been sanctioned in March last. Detailed plans and estimate are still to be prepared. The scheme is estimated to cost. Rs.6,00,000

(10) Ghatkopar Drainage. - This is a Munl. Drainage Scheme. The fair plans and estimates the latter amounting to Rs.5,90,825 (including centage charges at 15 p.c.) have been submitted by the C.P.H.E. to Govt. Consideration of the scheme has been deferred pending receipt of the proposals for financing it.

(11) Jalgaon Drainage. - This is a Munl. Drainage Scheme. All preliminary data and survey completed. The scheme is estimated to cost Rs.6,00.000. Detailed plans and ests. will be prepared by the Ex Sany. Project Sub-Dn.

(12) Danda & Santa Cruz Drainage. - This is a Munl. scheme and is estimated to cost Rs.6,39,963. The Muny's proposals for financing the scheme are still awaited.

(13) Nadiad Water Supply Scheme.- This is a Munl. scheme and is estimated to cost Rs.11,00,000. The survey estimate has been sanctioned in Novr. 1943. The detailed plans and ests. have not been recd. so far.

(14) Godhra Water Supply. - There are no papers relating to this scheme in this Deptt.

Id/-
14-4-44

Thro' F.B.

Staff employed in the Public Health Branch.

C.P.H.E. to Government.

1 Asstt. Engineer.
1 Deputy Engineer.
1 Mechnl.Asstt.
6 Overseers.
1 Divl. Accountant.
20 Clerks.
1 Storekeeper.
2 Draftsmen.
2 Asst. Draftsmen.
3 Tracers.
14 Servants.

Boring Section.

2 Mechanical Overseers.
1 Clerk.
1 Fitter.
2 Watchmen.

Poona Water Works Sub-dn.

1 Deputy Engineer.
3 Overseers.
1 Supervisor.
7 Clerks.
2 Asstt.Storekeepers.
1 Tracer.

1 Water rate Supdt.
6 Water rate Collectors.
10 Meter-readers.
2 Time-keepers,
1 Delivery clerk.
7 Servants.

Hospital Town Water Supply Sub-dn.

1 Deputy Engineer.
2 Overseers.
1 Asstt. D'man
1 Tracer.
3 Clerks
3 Peons.

Sanitary Project Sub-dn.

1 Deputy Engineer.
5 Overseers.
1 Draftsman.
1 Asstt.Draftsman.
2 Tracers.
4 Clerks.

4 Peons.

1 Chowkidars.

Ambernath Water Supply.

1 Supervisor.

1 Overseer.

3 Clerks

1 Tracers

3 Peons.

1 Chowkidar.

Id/-
10-5-44.

2. Out of the 18 Schemes proposed for the P.W.R. Programme, only two large schemes, viz. Neersagar W.S. scheme for Dharwar and Hubli, and Belgaum Water Supply Scheme have been proposed for execution in the first 5 years period.

From the c.n. it will be seen that the work of preparing ps. & es. for the schemes is in various stages and considerable work is required for completing them in all respects. Due to the great difficulty in obtaining technical staff at the present moment, it is proposed that the work of preparing detailed p.& e. for only the two schemes referred to in para. 1 above may be taken in hand now and the establishment engaged on this work may after the completion of these projects be continued in the preparation of p. & e. for the remaining schemes. The C.P.H.E. has reported that the following establishment would be required for ~~xhhmm~~ the preparation of the P. & e. for all the schemes.

1	E. E	@	750/-
3	D. Es.	@	750/-
12	Subordinates	@	1200/-
	Clerical and menial establishment	@	2500/-
	Travelling allowance.		2000/-
	Contingencies		250/-
	Total ...		8,050 p.m.

This requirement appears to be excessive. It is seen that the detailed ps. & es. for the Neersagar Project have already been prepared and these have been referred back to C.P.H.E. for clarification of certain points. Hence it is presumed that little work now remains to be done for final completion of the Project.

The Belgaum Water Works Scheme is likewise practically completed and is only to be modified to some extent.

It is therefore considered that it is not necessary to appoint an E. E. on the project work. The C.P.H.E. has already under him a sanitary Project Sub-division comprising of staff shown in the attached statement. It is however not known whether the sub-Division is capable of undertaking the additional project work of these two schemes. The C.P.H.E. may there-fore be asked to report immediately whether the existing s.p. sub-division can undertake this extra work and if so what extra staff would be required. In case the additional work is too heavy for the sub-division to cope up with the C.P.H.E. may be asked to propose opening of another Project sub-divn. and submit details for the same. Ordinarily one D.E. assisted by 4 overseers should be able to tackle the two schemes within a few months.

The strength of the C.P.H.E's office may be ~~xx~~ required to be increased by the appointment of one D.E. This D.E. would acquire experience and will be valuable when the work expands.

The selection of the two schemes for execution in the first 5 years requires to be finally confirmed by Government so that ~~xx~~ the Project work may be taken in hand.

Id/-
11-5-44

I agree with the note of the Dy. Secy. (Jr. R); with trained staff so difficult to obtain at present it would be unwise to take on large numbers of untrained men for the specialized work of the P.H. Branch.

It will suffice if only that staff necessary to bring the Belgaum and the Dharwar and Hubli scheme up-to-date are now engaged and when they have completed the schemes in question they carry on gradually with the others.

Later, if due to cessation of hostilities liabilities or other reasons, trained men become freely available the question case be reconsidered.

Id/-
17-5-44

(E.B.I).

Resubmitted with a draft for approval.

Sd/-
22-5-44

Thrgh. M.B. & P.W.H. Branch

Id/-
24-5-44

Letter

Confidential & Urgent.
No.6269/36-E.

Public Works Department.
Bombay Castle, 26th May 1944.

To

The Consulting Public Health Engineer to Government.

Subject:- Establishment required for Post War Reconstruction Works.

Reference: Your D.O.No.C/2446, dated the 6th March 1944 to the Secretary, Revenue Department.

2. On account of the difficulty in obtaining technical staff, it has been decided by Government that the work of preparing plans and estimates for only two schemes, viz (1) the Neersagar Water Supply Scheme for Dharwar and Hubli and (2) the Belgaum Water Supply scheme should be taken in hand at present as Post War Reconstruction Schemes. The establishment engaged on this work should, after completion of the above two schemes, be continued for the preparation of the plans and estimates of the remaining Post- War Reconstruction Schemes relating to Public Health works.

3. The detailed plans and estimates for the Neersagar project have already been prepared and referred to you for clarification of certain points. It, therefore, appears that little work now remains to be done for the final completion of this project. The Belgaum Water Supply scheme is likewise practically completed and is only to be dodified to some extent.

4. In view of the position explained above, Government considers that it is not necessary to entertain the full establishment detailed by you in the accompaniment to your letter, mentioned above, for planning the Public Health schemes. Government has already sanctioned continuance of the Sanitary Project Sub-division upto the 28th February 1945. You are requested to report whether this sub-division is capable of undertaking the two schemes referred to in paragraph 3 above and if so, to submit proposals for the additional staff that will be required to be entertained in the Sub-division for this purpose.

5. If you condider that it is not possible for the the existing Sanitay Project Sub-division to undertake any additional work even with additional staff, you are requested to submit detailed proposals for the opening of a further project Sub-division to undertake the completion of the two projects referred to in paragraph 3 above and thereafter the preparation of the plans and estimates of the remaining Post- War Reconstruction Schemes relating to Public Health Works. Ordinarily one Deputy Engineer assisted by 4 overseers and the usual office staff should easily be able to deal with the two schemes within a few months. You are also requested to submit proposals for the entertainment of any additional establishment considered necessary in this connection in your office with full justification therefore, for the preparation of the Post War Reconstruction schemes relating to Public Health Works on the basis indicated above.

By order of the Governor of Bombay,

Id/-
27-5-44

For Secretary to the Government of Bombay.
Public Works Department (Irrigation).

Copy to the Secretary, Revenue Department and the Superintending Engineer, Project Circle, for information.

BKB
26/5

Id/-
27-5

CONFIDENTIAL & URGENT. No.C/3526 of 1944.

From

R.A.Collett, Esquire, M.B.E., F.R.San.I
CONSULTING PUBLIC HEALTH ENGINEER
TO GOVERNMENT ,BOMBAY,
POST BOX NO. 39, POONA;

To

The Secretary to Government ,
Public Works Department, Bombay .

Poona, 30th June 1944.

Subject:- Establishment required for Post War Reconstruction Works.

Sir,

Reference - Government letter (Confidential), P.W.D. No. 6269/36-E, dated the 26th May 1944.

2. I regret to note that the Government letter referred to above is a complete set back to my proposals submitted under my No.C/2446, dated the 6th of March 1944. Before, however, giving reasons why Government should create proper P.W.D. divisions to deal with these schemes for Post War planning, I will reply to the above letter.

3. Ref. Paras 2 and 3 of Govt. letter- I note that only the two water supply schemes, viz. (1) Neersagar Water Supply and (2) the Belgaum Water Supply , have to be prepared in detail. In this Government have it in view that the plans and estimate es of these two schemes should be prepared in sufficient detail that they may be taken up for execution immediately after the completion of the projects and their sanction. The plans and estimates alreadyprepared give only the broad outlines of the schemes and their approximate costs. They are not detailed plans and estimates. The completion of the detailed projects, including all working plans and estimates in respect of these two schemes will take

at least another 12 months, if a separate establishment is engaged on these works alone. The Neeresagar schemes in particular has been rushed through with a scratch staff and the plans and estimates already prepared give only a general ideas of the scheme. I want to study this scheme in detail, but owing to excessive executive routine, accounts and financial duties, I have been unable to exercise the supervision which should have been given to such an important scheme.

The same can be said of the Belgaum Water Supply scheme also. Considerable modification of the schemes is necessary on account of the changed conditions . It has now to be re-designed to embrace all the likely participant bodies and the financial forecasts have to be worked out Both these have been declared to be Govt. Schemes and many detials have to be worked out on this account .

4. Rfce. Para 4 of Government letter- The existing Project Office has been working for over 12 months and a few schemes have been produced, but owing to shortage of staff, they have been unable to cope with even 20 per cent, of the schemes awaiting design. Until they have an Executive Engineer and competent staff, progress is bound to be slow. I therefore consider that it is useless to expand its activities by adding some overseers to deal with these two schemes in particular.

5. Rfce. Para 5 of Government letter - Opening up a second Sub-division will not solve the inherent difficulty. Government must realise that schemes costing Rs.1.5. crores and over cannot be designed by a Deputy Engineer and a few overseers (some just out of college), unless the Consulting Public Health Engineer devotes more attention to the preparation of these important schemes at every stage.

6. It is a pity that Government does not yet realise that unless my office is made a Superintending Engineer's office with at least two divisions working directly under my control that progress on schemes of public health is

bound to be unsatisfactory. I do not know why Government should hesitate to create my branch into a Circle, when less important Provinces have a Superintending Engineer and in some cases a Chief Engineer presideing over Public Health engineering works. In 1937, the Government of India asked the Bombay Government for my services to advise them technically and our recommedations were accepted and the scheme was completed at cost of a hlf a crore of rupees. For this work, our agreed-upon honoraria was voluntarily doubled by the Government of India. Government are also aware that similar requests for the services of their Public Health Engineer have been received from many foreign Governments, during the last three years, e.g. Ceylon, Baluchistan, Gwalior, Rajkot etc.In all these cases, I have had to advise Government to refuse the loan of my services on account of the routine duties. Had I been able to go, there is no doubt that Goverment and allmy staff would have benefited by the added experience of foreign conditions which would have been acquired. If the Government of India and other Engineforeign bodies have this opinion of the Bombay Public Health Engineer, it surely proves that he is being wasted in doing ordinary executive duties. I am sometimes asked by senior Govt. officers as to who is to take over my duties when I retire. My reply is that the status of the office must be improved and then ~~reply is that the status of he~~ by public advertisement it should be possible to get a man of the necessary experience. In Government's interest I strongly advise ~~necessary e~~ that the Cunsulting Public Health Engineer be relieved of his executive duties; only then will Government get the benefit of his long experience.

on the disposal of drainage for the capital of India Mr. Howell of the Punjab and self advised the Govt. of India technically

7. Post War planning in Public Health engineering must be put in hand straightaway . The present staff cannot be used to its fullest advantage with one Consulting Public Helath Engineer with divisional officers status and so many sub-divisions under him. If really constructive work is to be done, it is necessary to make this office an S.E.s office and to have under it two divisions to start with . It has been found impossible to run the Poona and Kirkee Water Works as a Sub-Division. The annual expenditure on these is Rs. 5 lakhs and the revenues Rs. 10½ lakhs. In order to pull on with the work, I have been obliged to cut this sub-divn. into two parts and to give the Kirkee section to one sub-divisional officer and the Poona section to another. Even now, the administration leaves much to be desired. I thought I had already made out a convincing case in my letter No. 8155 of 6th August 1943 to raise this office to the status of a Superintending Engineer's office, and I hope Government are still seriously considering these suggestions. I therefore stronly advise that Poona Water Works be made into a division as soon as possible, and there is also a strong case for the 'Public Health Works Division' to be formed and this officer would be in charge of all important projects. I am not satisfied with the work done by the Project Office Sub-division, but this mostly due to the fact that the salaries paid to the staff previously, both to the engineering and clerical, were too low, with the result that resignations were frequent and this hampered the progress of the work. Government have now been pleased to improve the starting pays of temporary overseers and this has relieved the situation to some extent. The clerical staff, however, are still difficult to obtain. I anticipate that when this Project Office is turned into a division and the salaries substantially increased that the work turned out will be of greater value to Government .

8. I attach herewith a statement showing the additional staff required and the annual expenditure to Government on account of the S.E.'s status of my office and the opening of these two divisions which it will be seen would not exceed Rs. 61,000 per annum. This is a small financial burden , when the value of large public health engineering water and drainage works are considered. Works amounting to over 7 crores of ruppes await design and so this amount of Rs. 61,000 per annum is a cheap contribution for schemes of such magnitude.

Sd/-

Consulting Public Health

Enclo:- 1 statement. Engineer to Government .

B.V.P.

The question of raising the status of the C.P.H.E. to that of a Sup. Engr. has been fully discussed on File No. 2455/36 (pp. 37-39). Circumstances do not appear to have changed which might necessitate the decision then taken to be reconsidered. It had been realised that considerable amount of planning for post-war reconstruction work was likely to be done by the C.P.H.E. in the near future. Having decided to confine the planning to two projects only for the present (Neeresagar and Belgaum W.S.Schemes) the pressure of planning work has actually been reduced.

2. In para. 3 of his letter the C.P.H.E. states that the plans and estimates already prepared give only the broad outlines of the schemes. From File No. 6250/36-II (p.71) however it is seen that the C.P.H.E. had submitted detailed plans and estimates for the Neeresagar scheme. Also the remakrs with which the plans and estimates have been returned are not of such a nature as to necessitate an elaborate recasting of the prepared plans and estimates.

3. As regards the Belgaum W.S. schemes the D.S. does not know exactly at what stage the plans and estimate are. It is however gathered that the survey work has been carried out by the Belgaum Dn. and the C.P.H.E. himself was sanguine about completing the Project within four months - vide p. 218 of file No. 486/36.

4. Coming to the C.P.H.E's proposals for establishment required for the preparation of the two schemes, it may be noted at the outset that the conversion of the Poona Water Works

Sub-Division into a Division has no bearing on the point at issue. As for the creation of a Public Health Works Division it is pointed out that the technical personnel (which is the one that really matters) prposed is almost the same as that existing in the current Sanitary Projects Sub-Division, with the exception that an Executive Engineer will be in charge of the proposed Division , while a Dy. Engr. is in charge of the existing Sub-Division. As it is extremely unlikely that an Engineer with the requisite knowledge and experience can be secured to fill the proposed post of an Executive Engineer , the post will necessarily have to be filled in by promoting one of the Dy. Engrs. under the C.P.H.E.I am afraid I am unable to see how the proposalto convert the Sanitary Sub-Division into a Division is going to result in better progress. I still think that opening of a second Project Sub-Division will be more helpful.

5. The necessity of expanding the Public Health Works Branch in the Post-War period when large construction works will have to be undertaken has been realised and I consider that it is necessary to take steips in the near future for recruiting and training the right type of candidates under the C.P.H.E. Aprt from the temporary establishment required for the large construction programme, permanent establishment will be required to run the important water works constructed by Government. Good men are not likely t. be attracted to this Branch unless definite prospects are held out to them. I think the C.P.H.E. may be requested separately to view the situation and make

definite suggestions as to the permanent and temporary requirements of engineers under class I and Class II and overseers.

Sd/-

13-7-44

I am afraid tht I am unable to agree with the proposal now put foward once again by the C.P.H.E.; I fear that that officer is so obsessed with the desire to get his post converted from that of an Ex.Engr. to that of a Superintending Engineer, that he fails entirely to view things from a rational point of view.

2. Only last January after very full noting Government decided that no case to create a Public Health Circle could be made out, and instead sanctioned an increased pay to the C.P.H.E.

3. Personally I disagree entirely with the C.P.H.E. undertaking construction works, which is entirely contrary to the rules of his appointment which lay down clearly that he is a consultant only, and I consider that if he confined his attention to this side of the work only he would be of greater value to Government , and would have the time he presses for, in which to devote his energy and specialized knowledge to the preparation of future schemes.

4. Whilst one must freely admit that all works can be more effectively carried out by specialists than by non-specialists, it would be quite wrong to say that the works at present, in my opinion wrongly, being carried out by the C.P.H.E.'s staff are being carried out by such specialists; this is definitely not the case, they are merely being carried out with the occasional inspection by a Specialist, the C.P.H.E and this would also be the case if the wroks were carried out by the normal

Divisions with the C.P.H.E. and this small staff as ~~would also be the case if the works were~~ Consultants. It is of importance to note that the staff of so called specialists were until very recently in many cases Work-charged and as noted frequently in other cases Subordinates ~~even though one may call them~~ by the Advisers, Subordinates in most cases remain Subordinates, even though one may call them Executive Engineers. As a matter of interest one man the C.P.H.E. contemplates making an Ex. Engr. is Mr. V.K.Majgaonkar, who has not been considered fit for the B.S.E.I., not considered fit to be an Ex. Engr. and has recently failed very signally as such in Kolhapur State.

In the present instance, as clearly pointed out by the Dy. Secy.(I. & R,) it is interesting to note that the C.P.H.E. is not asking for increased staff to do the work, but is asking that all his staff, including himself, shall be up-graded, and I may say that I am quite unable to accept the necessity for this.

If the P.W.W. Sub-Division takes too much of the C.P.H.E's time and should, as he insists, be a question this may be separately considered and the staff be placed under the S.E., D.I.C., for administrative purposes, as it was previously . The C.P.H.E. will still be available whenever necessary for consultation. Ambernath Water Supply can easily be looked after by S. Thana Division . If this is done much of the routine work of the C.P.H.E's office will be taken away.

In the circumstances I consider the C.P.H.E. should be informed that Govt. sees no reason to alter the decision arrived at, after full consideration only in January last; it considers that if the C.P.H.E. confines his energies to consultant work as per orders, he should have sufficient time

to deal fully with future projects; if however he desires further relief P.W.W . Division will, as in the past, be taken over by D.I.C. and Ambernath Water supply by the .E. Thana Division. For the preparation of the two schemes required in the first five years period of the P.W.H. programme, a Sub-Division consulting of one Dy. Engr. and 4 subordinates should suffice and proposals for the opening of this may be submitted early .

Sd/-

16-7-44

Secy (H.D.) I agree .

C.P.H.E. may be informed accordingly.

Sd/-

16-7-44.

B.V.P.

Confdl. & V. Urgent.

P. W. D.,
Poona 16th August 1944.

No. 6269/36-E.

To

The C. P. H. E. to Government.

Subject :— Estabt. required for the P. W. R. works relating to the P. H. Schemes.

****

Reference : Your letter No. C/6326, dated the 30th June 1944. in which you have proposed the concession of the P. W. D. Sub- Division into a dedision, and the formation of a 'Public Health Works Division,'., To enable these two proposals to be fully considered by Government you are requested to state whom you suggest should be considered for appointment to the Two Executive Charges, Full qualifications, experience and complete history of services under this Govt. of the officers recommended should be given in each case.

By order of the Governor of Bombay,

D. A. Nil

Id/-
16-9-44

Id/-
16-9-44.

Ex B. (1)

C. P. H. E. to Govt. expedited under No. 6269/36 (1) dated the 19-9-44.

Id/-
19-9-44

Id/-
19/9

Issued No.
On 19-9-44.

Rvrv.

CONFIDENTIAL & VERY URGENT.

Tel: Address
"Helenger"
Telephone No. 557

No. C/8182 of 1944.

From

R. A. Collett, Esquire, M. B. E., F. R. San.I.
Consulting Public Health Engineer,
to Government,
Bombay,
Post Box No. 39, Poona.

To

The Secretary to Government,
Public Works Department,
Poona.

Poona, 21st August 1944.

Subject:— Establishment required for the Post War Reconstruction works relating to Public Health Schemes.

Sir,

As directed in your letter No. 6269/36-E, dated the 16th August 1944, I suggest that the following two officers should be appointed to the two proposed executive charges, as they have both had experience in mechanical engineering and water supply and drainage works.:—

(1) Executive Engineer, Poona Water Works Division.

Name — Mr. V. K. Majgaonkar, B. E. (Mechanical), B. S. E.

His qualifications are B. E. (Mechanical) of the College Engineering, Poona. He was appointed in the P. W. D. on 16th April 1923 and has therefore had 21 years experience in the department, and is shown as No. 25 in the Assistant Engineers' cadre— Please see Civil List (corrected up to 1st Jany. 1944.) Most of his time has been spent on mechanical and electrical works in connection with the construction of the Lloyd Dam at Bhatgar. His personal Register is quite satisfactory on the whole and most officers state that he is hard working, intelligent, of pleasing manners, strong and active with a good character. He has worked under me directly for nearly 20 months and has improved out of all recognition, and I now find him a most useful engineer in Public Health Works. He has been directly

Responsible .....

responsible for the erection of the large filtration plant at Sholapur, which is nearly completed, and am glad to say has been constructed in these days of high prices inside estimate. He has also designed two other major works of importance (1) Ahmednagar Filtration Scheme, and (2) Matheran Arch Dam Scheme for supplementary storage. He has also done considerable amount of touring and submits reports of good value and what is more, is tactful in his dealings with municipalities and other outside bodies. He is the senior most engineer under me and is deserving of promotion, and with his mechanical qualifications and experience will be quite fit and of great use in a Mechanical charge like the Poona and Kirkee Water Works. His Personal Register is submitted herewith.

(2) Executive Engineer, Public Health Works Division.

Name - Mr. S. E. Wadia, B. E. (Civil), A. M. I. E., M. R. San.I.

He was appointed to the P. W. D. on the 6th of July 1927 and has had therefore 17 years experience, all of which has been spent on water supply and drainage works. I have found him extremely useful on the design of new projects. He has been intimately connected with the design of the ' 1940 Kirkee Water Works', which embraces the best features of water works in other parts of the world. This new filter plant has been a great success and much appreciated by the military department. He has also had many years experience of design and construction of drainage works. Recently he has carried out the Aundh Hospital Water Supply and Drainage works. He is for the present entrusted with the construction of the Pooona Catonment Drainage. He is a remarkably bright man, who is popular with all officers with whom he comes into contact and I frequently depute him to meet high officers such as the Commander Royal Engineers and others and all testify to his pleasing manners and good understanding of his work. He is now in direct charge of the Project Office, which is doing similar work on a small scale to the suggested — Public Health Works Division, and I am sure that he will fill the position of the Executive Engineer with distinction. For his outstanding ability, he was recently selected by the Public Service Commission for the special

post of the Deputy Engineer, Project Office. I am sure he will prove a good addition to the Bombay Engineers' cadre. Recently, Government have also promised to look into his case for promotion, if and when opportunity occurred. Please see Government letter, Pool and Services Department, No. 4083/34-B dated 26th April 1944. His personal Registeer is also submitted.

I have made the above two recommendations after a careful study of all other Assistant or Deputy Engineers and the recommendations are made solely on account of their knowledge of Public Health Engineering and their unique experience in water supply and drainage, which I do not think is possessed by any other engineer in the Civil List. I have made the above recommendations in the best interests of Government and the Public Health Engineering efficiency.

Encls:- 2 Personal Registers.
2 Brief History of Service.

Sd/-

Consulting Public Health,
Engineer to Government.

I had suggested and hoped that this proposal would be discussed by C. P. H. E. with Secy. and with A (E) — the latter, because in normal times the work of C. P. H. E. is, at any rate in theory, chiefly connected with Public Health Schemes which are mainly constructed by Local Bodies. I do not know how far this was done.

2. Although he has not said so clearly, I think the main reason why C. P. H. E. has again put up this propcsal is that he really has no time for any independent thinking, study and initiation of big schemes, so long as he is tied down, as Executive Engineer, to the enormous amount of routine and supervision work which now falls to his lot.

3. This seems to me so clear as not to need argument. It is in fact the change in the situation which has occurred since the proposal was somewhat recently considered. Since that time we have been considering post-war reconstruction and have come to the conclusion that Public Health Schemes must loom large in it. It is true that the C. P. H. E. has been informed in the letter on page 39 that he can confine himself for the immediate present to the Dharwar-Hubli and Belgaum waterworks. But as C. P. H. E. observes, such schemes (costing 2 crores) cannot be designed by Deputy Engineers, and it seems prima facie clear that until C. P. H. E. can himself visit the places and really get down to personal and very close examination of these large projects, he cannot be expected to produce the results. Such a procedure as the present is one which would never be dreamt of in a non-Government firm dealing with projects of this nature and I am surprised at the view taken in P. W. D. compared with the view taken by that department in regard to other large schemes passing through that Department.

4.....

4. Before passing on, it follows from what I have expressed at great length in previous notes that I am by no means in agreement with the views expressed in Secy. P. W. D. 's note. Nor can I for a moment accept the orders proposed to be issued in para 3 of the draft reply which take us back to the position before I began to deal with this case and express views entirely contrary to those put forward by me. I do not propose to tell C. P. H. E. at this stage that he should devote himself entirely to consultant work according to the position which obtained in 1934. I cannot conceive how P. W. D. can consider that there has been no improvement in the progress and execution of Public Health Works as compared with the interregnum between the abolition of C. P. H. E.'s position as a constructive as well as a Consultant officer on the departure of Mr. Maddocks and the time at which Mr. Collett took over. During the interregnum there was practical stagnation, whereas there has been welcome progress since Mr. Collett's time. The second point, viz. that Mr. Collett should hand over two of his main water-works to non-experts is also contrary to the view I put forward and to anyone, who has seen the Poona Water Works as I have, it savours of the ridiculous. It would be equally logical to suggest that, assuming that at any time C. P. H. E. was not fully occupied, he should take over an ordinary Executive Engineer's charge.

repeat these views, which are evident from the noting. As to the two points mentioned in that draft para, it is surprising to me that we should propose to - - - -

5. Since I last noted I have seen the Poona Water Works in more detail. During the war the following main works have been carried out beyond the existing main works and the boosting station for Yeravda:

(i) boosting works at Yeravda to carry the supply (a) to air works at Yeravda and (b) 2 miles beyond to the new aerodrome, and subsequently another supply to Diggi several miles away; (ii) new works at Kirkee which are very efficient works on modern lines and other incidental extensions to Aundh and the Kirkee area. The whole is now

a vast scheme.....

a vast scheme fully qualifying both in importance and revenue for an Executive Engineer's charge. If it was a non-official concern, no one could doubt that it would be far more extensively manned in respect of senior officers.

6. Nor could it be seriously argued any longer that, with his present work of (a) Water Works under his direct charge (b) the large number of water and drainage schemes executed and being executed for the Army (c) Depot Workshops (d) boring (f) planning of Public health project works on a larger scale than before, including 2 projects costing 2 crores, the C. P. H. E.'s work is in any way comparable with that of an Executive Engineer.

7. A (P) has in fact accepted the position that it ought to be a Superintending Engineer's charge, if the practical difficulties in creating it could be got over, although he is as yet not fully in agreement with me as to the extent that it should involve actual construction of Public Health works by the C. P. H. E. But it will no doubt be agreed th at any rate when the time comes for Government to construct the two large projects in Belgaum and Dharwar, these could not be done by the ordinarily Executive Engineer and without direction by officer of high status at the top.

8. I fully realise as before the practical difficulti involved. I will deal with these *again* at the risk of repetition.

(a) Mr. Collett is on extension and not in the best of health. It would therefore be of doubtful advantage to make him a Superintending Engineer for the short time which remains, unless we had a successor clearly in view. To appoint an Executive Engineer dur the interval until we should find an expert and competent successor, if he had to give up at short notice, would make the change of no value, especially

if the .....

if the acting man was allowed to stake out a claim to confirmation.

To this I think the answer is whether we should not now, as I think we must , place on record, as part of post-war planning, that the post must in future be held by an expert to be recruited by advertisement or otherwise. If that was done, I see no objection to appointing Mr. Collett as Superintending Engineer as a temporary measure.

(b) The salient point made in P. W. D. noting that no advantage would result in merely promoting to higher status of Executive Engineers the same persons who will be doing the same work.

This seems logical as such and I think enquiry will have to be made as to when Mr. Collett has in mind for promotion. On the other hand the same thing occurs in other departments whenever such changes occur— and we are doing it in P. W. D. now. If the persons concerned are fit, there could be no objection to promoting them and conversely , if they are not fit, others must be recruited. I realise that closer examination is necessary, because in conversation Mr. Collett has often mentioned that he cannot rely on such concerns as the Poona Water Works working smoothly without a good deal of personal supervision on his part.

(c) Mr. Collett certainly shows a certain lack of administrative capacity in such matters of accounts and interpretation of Government orders and might therefore be difficult to control as a Superintending Engineer.

This risk would, I think, have to be taken, if the future of Public health and allied works in their post-war aspect is, as it seems to be, sufficiently important.

9. I observe now that we gave him no reply when he last made this proposal in his letter of 6-8-43 in File 2455/36 and merely informed him (p. 42 of that file) that his pay was increased without any reference to the correspondence. The reason seems that he was orally informed (by me) that his

proposal.....

proposal for ~~some~~ conversion of the post to S. E. was not accepted. But even so I should have expected the letter to him to state that Government after consideration had decided that it was not necessary to convert the post to one of S. E. , but that recognising the additional work, it has decided to give him extra pay.

10. I think the best course will be for A (E) in the first instance to record his opinion both generally and on the future issue. As I have said, it does seem necessay to give better facilities to the C. P. H. E. to get on with future planning.

Id/-
4-8-44

A (E)

Mr. Collett has not discussed this question with me and I was unaware till now that it had been reopened.

2. From the departmental point of view I should naturally welcome the strengthening of the C. P. H. E 's . Department, the case for which is certainly stronger now in view of preparations for P. W. R. than it was when it was mooted last year. I also agree with A (E) that the obvious method of strengthening it is as shown by Mr. Collett in his statement at p. 43 ante, at least as regards the posts of S. E, and two Executive Engineers, The Chief objections to this are, firstly, that Mr Collettt himself cannot serve much longer and that we should thus be creating a new S. E's. post to which the vested interests of the I. S. E. or B. S. E. would have so strong a claim that a member of one of them would obtain it permanently to the exclusion of a directly recruited expert; and secondly, that Mr. Collett's proposal merely amounts to upgrading himself and two of his S. D. Os. without any change in the character of the work which they are doing at present.

3. As regards the first objection, I agree with A (E) that it should suffice if it is made abundantly clear at this stage that Mr. Collett's permanent successor will be the best

Expert.....

expert that Government can obtain by direct recruitment on the pay of an S. E. after public advertisiment, and that any interregnum will give no preferential claim to the temporary incumbent. I see from other papres that it is proposed to obatin from the Army a Veterinary Officer suitable to succeed Mr. Farbrother as Director. If officers of that calibre can beobtained, even now, would it not be possible to get a Public Health Engineer from the Army in time to relieve Mr. Collett. If not, then the safeguard suggested above should be adequate.

4 As regards the second objection I agree that Mr. Collett should be asked whom he has in view for the two new Executive Engineer's posts. But even if it transpires that he does intend to promote S. D, Os. already employed on the Poona Water Works and Projects Sub-Divisions respectively, there will still surely be the advantage that ~~the~~ such promotion will give the office independent powers of sanction and in accounts matters, thus relieving Mr. Collett of routine work which at present makes too great demands on his attention.

Id/-
11-8-44.

A. (R)

The papers may now go to P. W. D. for any further noting considered necessary and to obtain the information at A.

Id/-
11-8-44

See P. W. D. (H. R.)

On the main question my note is at pages 50-51, I have nothing to add to it.

2. In accordance with "A" on page 60 ante the C. P. H, E. was asked to state the officers he had in view for Executive Engineers and his reports are put up below.

3. I do not think objection can be taken to Mr. Wadia, who is qualified and who has spent his whole life on Public Health Works so that although probably junior to other officers can be selected for his specialized knowledge.

4.....Regarding.

4. Regarding the second appointment, the C. P. H. E. himself seems very undecided, he first recommended Mr. Majgaonkar, but during discussion with me indicated clearly that he would not be upset if this recommendation was not accepted; he then proposed Mr. Gadre but was by no means enthusiastic about him, and in addition he has endorsed a recommendation on the application of Mr. M. M. Vyas.

5. Mr. Majgaonkar, in my opinion, is not suitable to hold an Executive charge, I have known him ~~well~~ well since 1928 and have had him working under me for many years; he is swollen headed and cannot be depended upon, and requires constant guidance in all but mechanical works at which I thought him fairly capable, but the C. P. H. E. not long ago remarked to me " He may have a mechanical degree, but he is not a mechanical Engineer." He was recently employed as Executive Engineer, Kolhapur State, where he proved a failure due, as far as I can gather, to a combination of conceit and lack of discipline.

Mr. Gadre, I do not know at all but the Secy. (R. & B.) tells me he is a very average man indeed; he has only been officiating as a Deputy Engineer in the General Provincial Service for about 3 years.

Mr Vyas has a certain amount of P. H. experience but is extremely junior being 47th on the list and his selection would mean passing over very many capable men.

6. I cannot personally recommend any man as suitable for the Water Works Division, and would suitable for the Water Division, and would suggest for consideration the conversion of the Project Sub-Dn. into a Dn. now, the C. P. H. E's post into that of an S. E. ,if that is the intention, and trying by general advertisement through the P. S. C. to get a Water Works Engineer, keeping the Water Works Sub-Dn. as a Sub-Dn. until a suitable

man.....

man is obtainable; however I believe A(R) proposes to discuss this matter personally with the C. P. H. E. I would stress only one further point, which is that the sole object of the proposed changes, as I understand them, is to give the C. P. H. E. time to attend personally to the more important project side of his work; this object will not be achieved if the officers holding charge of the Divisions are not capable of doing so and require guidance from the C. P. H. E. to the same extent they do at present. I would urge also that it should be impressed upon the C. P. H. E. , Mr. Collett, if he is to be made a S. E., that he must conform to Rules and Regulations, otherwise the work of all concerned will be very considerably increased at a time when any increase is to be deprecated.

Id/-
26-9-44.

A (R)

On the main point I refer to my previous minute and that of A(E) and think the time has come to make the post one of S. E. and to place on record our future intentions in regard to recruitment of a successor.

For the rest I am in agreement with Sec. P. W. D. 's note of 26-9-44.

A(E)
A(F)
H. E. (G. S.)

I think A(E) should see a gain before the cost is passed on.

Id/-
26-9-44

I agree to the course proposed

Id/-
28/9.

I will agree to the proposals on the condition suggested, especially-

(1) that it should be definitely laid down by Government that Mr. Collett's successor for S. E. will be obtained by advertisement or recruitment from the army, of an Expert, and that no I. E. S. or B. E. S. will have any claim to the appointment;

(2) that an attempt should be made to recruit an outside Expert for the Water Works Sub-Division at once, and to keep

keep.....

and to keep the Water Works Sub-Division as a Sub-Division until an Expert is secured.

Mr. Collet's seems are 90 per cent geese.

24/-
23-9-44

Office should put up the necessary G. R. early only.

(1) converting the post of C. P. H. E. to S. E's grade.

(2) Indicating clearly how the successor to the present C. P. H. E. is to be appointed.

(3) Converting the project Sub-Dn. to a Dn and making Mr. Whdia Ex. Engr.

(4) All pays should be settled, presumably M. Collett will have to be given Rs. 1850/- as plans E. E. 6-8 and Mr. Whdia will be raised to Senior Scale.

The G. R. should be submitted through Dy. Secy (R & B) to both Secys.

(5) Para 2 of A(F)'s note should be dealt with separately but without delay.

4-10-44.

24-5-45

E.B.(I). 719-1/36

P.W.Deptt.

Resubmitted with reference to Secy.(I)'s note dated 4th Oct.-1944.

2. The draft G.R. put up may be shown U.O. to the F.D. and the P & S.D. before issue. The points raised in the following paras. are, however, for consideration and orders.

Id/- 18.10.44.

3. Conversion of the post of the C.P.H.E. into that of an S.E. :- It has been decided by Govt. that the post at present held by Mr. Collett should be converted into that of a superintending engr's status. It is for consideration whether the designation of this new post may remain the same as before, viz. the C.P.H.E. to Govt.

I think so.
Id/- 18.10.44.

4. Fixation of Mr. Collett's pay in his new post:- Mr. Collett is at present on extension of service, the period of which will expire on the 31st March 1945. His present pay is as under:-

i) Pay Rs. 1375p.m.; special pay Rs.225. overseas pay £ 30p.m. Expressed in Rs. the value of his pay plus overseas pay will be Rs. 2,000 p.m. The scale of pay admissible to a specialist officers of the S.E' status is as shown in columns 6-8 of the statement at page 81 ante.

on the age basis Mr. Collett's pay comes to Rs. 2150 + £ 13-6-8 as the overseas pay. The question as to what scale of pay should be fixed for the new post has not yet been finally decided. Similarly what pay Mr. Collett should be allowed to draw is also to be finally decided. Please see in this connection para 7 of A(R)'s note and para 11 of A(F)'s note at page 30 and 33 respectively of file No. 2455/36 A(R) has stated that Mr. Collett should be allowed to draw pay at the rate of Rs. 2150 p.m. in his new appointment. He will also be eligible for the overseas pay at the rate of £ 13.6.8 p.m.

Orders are requested-

(i) Whether the scale of pay of the C.P.H.E's post may be as shown in columns 6-8 of statement within;

or

Whether the scale admissible to the S.E. in the I.S.E.viz. Rs. 1750-100-2150 with the overseas pay of £ 13.6.8 may be sanctioned for the new post.

This alternative I think-vide also para3 of A(E)'s note dated11-8-44 at p.74. Id/- 18-10-44.

(ii) What pay may be allowed to Mr. Collett.

Rs.2150 £ 13.6.8 on age bar is.I suggest. Id/- 18-10-44

The F.D. will have to be consulted on this point.

5. Successor to Mr. Collett:- It has been decided that Mr. Collett's successor for the post of the C.P.H.E. (of the S.E's status) should be appointed by advertising or by recruitment from the Army of an expert and that no officer of the I.S.E., B.S.E.Class I or II should have any claim on the apptt. in question.

Yes.Id/-18.10.44

After the question of the scale of pay to be allowed for the C.P.H.E's post is decided the C.P.H.E. may, if approved, be asked to suggest a suitable advertisement stating therein detailed qualifications expected for the post the age limit etc. It may also be accordingly decided whether the post may be advertised in India or in England or in both. If the post is to be advertised in India alone it may be left to the Bldg. & P.S.C. for filling in the post.

Both in India and in England I think Id/- 18-10-44. I suggest an indefinite period of contract subject to 6 months notice of termination on either side

6. Creation of the Public Health Works Dn:-

Mr. S.E. Wadia who has been appointed as Public Health Works Dn. ge of the Sanitary sanctioned period of ice on the 31st Decr. is to be continued ation of the Public ay be decided who should succeed Mr. Wadia as a Dy. Engr. in charge of the Sanitary Project Sub-Dn. As at present proposed the Public Health Work Dn has no sub.dn. under it. It is for consideration whether this Dn. should have some of the existing sub.dns in the Public Health Br. under its control. If so it may please be decided which of these sub.dns should be transferred under the control of the P.H.Works Dn.

These points could possibly be considered by Secys in consultation with the C.P.H.E in Poona. Id/- 18-10-44.

1. Poona Water Works Dn.(Proposed tobe converted) into a Dnl.Charge.
2. Hospital Town Water Supply Sub.
3. Ambernath Water Supply Sub.dn.
4. Dapuri Workshe Sub. Dn.
5. Boring Works Su Dn.
6. Sanitary Projec Sub.dn.

7. Scale of pay to be allowed for the post of Ex.Engr. Public Health Works Dn.

The scale of pay of the Ex.Engr., Public Health Works Dn. will presumably be that corresponding to the scale admissible to an Ex.Engr. in the B.S.E. ClassI service. The Ex. Engr's scale in that service is Rs. 350-350-350-20-450-E.B.-30.660.E.B.40-900.

Id/- 18-10-44

Mr. Wadia's present pay as Dy. Engr. in charge of the sanitary Project Sub.Dn. is Rs. 295p.m. On his apptt. as Ex. Engr. Public Health WorksDn., his pay will be fixed at Rs. 350 p.m. The post will be included in the General Provincial Service under this Deppt. The F.D. and the P & S.D. may see on this point.

Id/- 18-10-44

8. Apptt. of Mr. Wadia as Ex. Engr. Public Health Works.Dn:- Mr. Wadia is a dy. Engr.; his apptt. as Ex.Engr. Public Health Works Dn. Will require acquiescence of the Bombay-Sind P.S.C. The Commission will be addressed separately in this matter. In the meantime Mr. Wadia is being appointed as a Ex. Engr. as a purely tempy. measure.

Id/- 18-10-44.

9. Conversion of the Poona Water Works Sub. Dn. into a Divisional Charge:- It has also been decided that the Poona Water Works Sub. Dn. should be converted into a Dn. After we get an expert for holding the dnl. charge. The C.P.H.E has been requested demi officially to inform Govt. about qualifications, etc. reqd. for the post of the Ex.Engr. Poona Water Works Dn. which is to be advertised in accordance with para 1(2) of A(F)'s note dated 28-9-44. This post will also be of an Ex. Engr's status on scale of pay corresponded to the Ex.Engr's grade in the B.S.E. Class I and will be included in the General Provincial service, under this Deptt. On receipt of the information called from the C.P.H.E. necy. draft advertisement will be put up for approval.

Id/- 18-10-44.

In the meantime the F.D. may see these papers with reference to the creation of the post of an Ex. Engr. Poona Water Works Dn.

Id/- 18-10-44.

10. Additional Subordinate estbt. Reqd. by the C.P.H.E.to Govt.:- At page 43 ante the C.P.H.E. had submitted a statement the showing the extra cost involved in the proposal to convert the existing office of the C.P.H.E. to Govt. into a superintending

gr's Office and the transformation of the existing Poona Water Works and Sanitary Projects sub. dn into two dns. The statement does not give the number of posts reqd. and the scales of the additional posts to be sanctioned in consequence of the reorganisation. The C.P. H.E. will be asked to furnish a statement showing the existing subordinate strength and the proposed subordinate strength of his office as also of those of the offices of the Ex. Engr's, Public Health Works Dn. and Poona Water Works Dn.

Id/- 18-10-44.

11. Revised accounting Procedure:- The Public Health Br. was reconstituted as a consulentant branch with effect from the 1st March, 1933. The status of the C.P.H.E. was that of an Ex. Engr. Accordingly certain instructions were given to the C.P.H.E. in the matter of accounting the expenditure that was to be incurred in the re-constituted Public Health Branch. Please see in this connection G.R. No. 6961/27 dated the 3rd Feby. 1934. As the status of the C.P.H.E. is being raised to that of an S.E, and as that officer will no longer be a consulting officer only, but will also be in charge of some executive work pertaining to the Public Health schemes it will be necy. to revise the orders issued in G.R. No. 6961/27, dated the ~~1939~~ 3rd Feb. 1934 and G.R. No. 1731/36 dated 12th April, 1939. This question will be taken up after the issue of the proposed resolution.

Id/- 18-10-44

Also see recent orders.re. percentages dealt with in Accounts Branches.

12. These papers may be refd.u.o. to the F.D. and the P & S.D., in succession, with reference to the above paras. before re submission.

Id/- 18-10-44.

Id/- 14-10-44.

1. Margines.

2. The decisions of Government in this case may, I think, be communicated to the Director of Information.

Id/- 18-10-44.

I agree with the marginal notes of the Dy. Secy. and with para 2 above.

Id/- 20-10-44.

I agree except in regard to para 2 of noting. I think CPHEis now a Minister (with para1of noting)and that the new designation should be S.E.P.H.

P.Re.para 6, reference should bemade to CPHE. It is not possible to do thims.

Id/-

U O K P D " P & S D.

The orders proposed by the P.W.D. may be agreed to, subject to the following remarks on the points raised in the P.W.D. note at pp. 83-85 ante.

2. Para 3 of the P.W.D. Office note (p.83).-

Please see para 1 of the Secy., P.W.D.'s note dated 26-10-44. It is proposed to change the designation from consulting Public Health Engineer, to S.E., Public Health. F.D. need have no objection.

3. Para.4 of the P.W.D. office note (p.83) and D.S.'s C.PW.D marginal notes.

It is proposed to sanction the I.S.E. scale of Rs. 1,750-100-2, 150 with O.S.P. of £ 13.6.8 for the new post of S.E. P.H. and to fix Mr. Collett's pay at Rs. 2,150 overseas pay of £ 13-6-8. So far as the payscale proposed for the post of S.E., P.H., is concerned, attention is invited to -

(i) para 8 of the Under Secy's note dated 3-12-43,
(ii) para 7 of A (F)'s note dated 9-12-43,
(iii) para 11 of A (F)'s note dated 15-12-43,
(iv) para 4 of A(F)'s note dated 17-12-43 at pp. 25-26,30,33,37-38 respectively of P.W.D. file No. 2455/36, and
(v) para 5 of A(E)'s note dated 11-8-44(p.74 ante).

The old and revised payscales sanctioned by Government for the posts of Superintending Engineers Government service offices are Rs. 1,450-75-,1750 and 1,100-50-1,300 respectively. As it is proposed to have the best expert that Govt. can obtain as Mr. Collett's successor and as it will be difficult to obtain experienced technical men during war time on a lower payscale, it is for consideration whether F.D. should agree to the proposed scale or whether we should advise that the revised sanctioned scale of Rs. 1,100-50-1,300 for Provincial Service officers should be tried to begin with and if this is considered inadequate, the old payscale viz. Rs. 1,450-75-1, 750 should be tried. In this connection attention is invited to G.R., R.D. No. 10069/39, dated 11th October 1944 in which Govt. have created a tempy. post of Mechanical & Technical Transport Engineer in the Agrl. Engineering Section of the Agrl. departments

on a payscale of Rs. 1,500-50-1,600 and Lt. col. Bates, R.I.A.S.C., an officer from the Army has been appointed to that post. In the circumstances, the old payscale of Rs. 1,450-75-1,750 would not seem to be inadequate. If the advertisement fails to evoke a good response, the proposed payscale of Rs. 1,750-100-2,150 can be sanctioned. There seems to be no objection to attach an overseas pay to the post as it is intended to recruit a candidate from overseas. It is alsoproposed to fix Mr. Collett's pay at Rs. 2, 150 plus O.S.P. at £ 13.6.8 on age basis.

P.D.may agree to the I.S.E. scale for S.E.sbeing 1750-100-2150 for this post plus O.S.P. where admissible.
S.N.

Attention is in this connection, invited to the second sub-para of para 8 of the Under Secy.'s note referred to at (i) in para 3 above wherein it has been pointed out that Mr. Collett is granted the I.S.E. Scale of Rs. 1750-100-2, 150 for suptg. Engineers, as a special case, he can be given only Rs. 1,750 plus £ 13.6.8 (O.S.P.) i.e., Rs. 1,928 and that he would drop his special pay. Strictly according to the rules Mr. Collett will be entitled to Rs. 1,750, the minimum of the proposed time-scale (plus £13.6.8).S.P.) if it is finally approved. Govt. has, however, recently raised his special pay of Rs. 400 to 225 in consideration of the arduous executive work he is doing. As the special pay was raised on account of the arduous work which Mr. C. is doing and in consideration of the fact that the proposal to raise his status to that of a suptg. Engr. was not tobe accepted, P.D. may perhaps hold that Mr. C. should not be given less than what he is getting at present. If this view is approved, we may advise that Mr. collett's pay may be fixed at Rs. 1,850plus 13.6.8.O.S.P. or Rs. 1,750 plus 70 personal pay to be merged in the next increment if he is continued in service and O.S.P. £13.6.8 on the basis of his present pay plus special pay plus overseas pay, as a special case, though strictly speaking special pay cannot be taken into account while fixing his pay in the S.E.'s scale.

Mr. Collett will remain on Rs. 1375/- as supdtg Eng. and that even if, on the analogy of Mr. Higham's case.

Mr. Collett's pay may be fixed in the I.S.E.scale for S.E.s, at Rs. 1850 plus £13.6.8. O.S.P as a special case.
S.N.

Mr. Collett's present emoluments are as under:-

------ Pay	Rs. 1,373/-
Special Pay	Rs. 225/-
O.S.P.	Rs. 400/-
	Rs. 2,000/-

4. Para 5 of the P.W.D. office note and Dy. Secy., P.W.D.'s marginal notes:- F.D. need have no objection to the post being advertised both in India and in England. As regards the suggestion of the Dy. Secy., P.W.D., in the bracketted portion of his note on the margin of p.84, attention is invited to G.R., F.D. No. 3958/33 of 9th April, 1938 from which it will be seen that the system of appointments on contract has been abolished in General. But exceptions to these general orders are permissible in cases in which Govt. are satisfied that service on a permanent or temporary basis is definitely unsuitable. Recently we have agreed to contract appointments for a period of 3 years in the cases of the Dir- of industries and also in the case of the Mechanical and transport Engineer in the Agrl. Engineering Section of the Agrl. Deptt. It is advisable to have short-term contract appointments. We may, therefore, advise that if the appointments of Mr. Collett's successor is to be made on a contract basis, the contract may be for a period of 3 years to begin with, the period being extended thereafter. We will also be able to know the market conditions then obtaining if the appointment is made for a shorter period. In the circumstances, it would be preferable to make the appointment on a contract basis for a period of 3 years in the first instance. The P.W.D. may be advised accordingly.

ıe contract may
› for a period
›to five years.
ıree years is too
ıort a period.
S.N.

5. Para 6 of the P.W.D. Office note:-

S.N. Please see para 2 of the Secy., P.W.D.'s note dated 26-10-44 wherein it is proposed to make a reference to the C.P., H.E. No. action is called for the present.

6. Para 7 of the P.W.D.Office note:-

S.N. The proposals in this para may be agreed to.

7. Para 8 of the P.W.D. Office note:-

No remarks are called for on this para in this Deptt. S.N.

8. Para 9 of the P.W.D. Office note:-

The proposal to convert the Poona Water Works Sub. Divn. into a Divn. has already been accepted Govt. The creation of an Ex. Engr.'s post will, therefore, be necessary and may be agreed to. S.N.

9. Para 10 of the P.W.D. Office of :-

No action is called for on this para at this stage. S.N.

10. Para 11 of the P.W.D. Office note:-

No remarks are called for at this stage. S.N.

11. The recurring expenditure involved in the proposed orders, is more than Rs. 25, 000 p.a. The P.W.D. is issuing these orders in anticipation of the G.G.'s approval.

12. The papers may be passed on to the F. & S.D.

Id/. 2-11-44

Id/- 2-11-44

Id/- 3-11-44

Id/- 6-11-44.

The Jt. Secy should, I think, see the case.

(E.B.I). P. M. D.

This Deptt. had recommended that the post of the S.E.P.H. (formerly known as C.P.H.E. to Govt.) should be on contract for indefinite period subject to six months notice on either side. The F.D. suggests that the post may be sanctioned on contract for a period upto five years in the first instance, (presumably terminable by six months' notice on either side).

Orders are requested whether the F.D's advice may be accepted. The F.D. has agreed that the post of the S.E.P.H. should be in the scale of Rs. 1750-100-2150 plus O.S.P. where admissible.

2. This Deptt. had proposed that M.R.A. Collett. should be allowed pay at the rate of Rs. 2150 p.m. plus O.S.P.lbs.13-6-8 p.m. in the new post of the S.E.P.H. The F.D. suggests that Mr.Colleth pay may be fixed at Rs. 1850 p.m. plus lbs. 13-6-8 in the scale of Rs. 1750-100-2150.

Pl. see para 4 of the O.M., at p. 83 ante in wh. it was explained that Mr. Colleth' present emoluments expressed in Rupee value are Rs.*2000 p.m. If the F.D's advice is accepted Mr. Collett, while holding the post of the S.E.P.H., will get Rupees #2007 p.m. only, i.e. an increase of Rs. 27 p.m. only.

* *Rs. 1375 pay
Rs. 225 spl.pay
lbs. 30 O.S.P.

Rs. 1850 pay
lbs. 13-6-8 O.S.P.
(@ 1 s. 6 d.)

Orders are requested whether the pay proposed by the F.D. for this new post may be accepted or whether this Deptt. may press for its recommendation. In the latter case these papers, with a fresh draft G.R. will be ~~kxxxxx~~ marked to Jt. Secy., F.D. before submission.

3. Necy. action with ref. to paras 6-11 of the O.M. at pages 84-85 ante will be taken hereafter.

4.....

4. On receipt of orders on paras 1 & 2 above a fresh & draft G.R. will be put up for approval & submission.

Id/-
20-11-44.

F.D's proposal may be accepted.

Id/-
25-11-44.

7191/36

(E. B. I). P. W. Deptt.

Submitted with a fresh draft G.R. for approval and submission. The G.R. also embodies decisions wh. have been reached in consultation with the F.D. at pp. 83-93 ante.

2. After the issue of the G.R. the S.E.P.H. (formerly known as C.P.H.E) will be requested to submit detailed ~~yr~~ proposals as regards the staff reqd. for the reorganised P.H. Br.

3. It has been decided that the P. W. W. Dn. shd. be opened after we get an outside Expert to hold the Dive Charge. Necy. action in this connection has been taken separately in File No. 7147/36.

Id/-
23-11-44.

Id/-
23-11-44.

SBS.

Since A (F) noted in paragraph 11 of his note on page 33 of file 2455/36, he has agreed to raising the special pay from Rs. 100 to Rs. 255. Mr. Collett is now over 55 and his only a few months to serve, and he has continued to do excellent work. I think, therefore, it would be somewhat ungracious to grant him an increase of pay of Rs. 27 per mensem only. I would, therefore, press for Rs. 2150/-.

2. As to change in the designation of the appointment, I think "Superintending Engineer, Public Health", is not suitable as drawing attention to the grade rather than to the nature of the post. I suggest "Public Health Engineer to Government".

3. I think it is also necessary to modify paragraph 3 of G.R. No.6961/27, dated the 3rd February 1936, in respect of future duties. The raising of the status hasbeen occasioned by the present & future partly constructional nature of the duties as well as by the general importance of the work in p.W.r. I have therefore added a new paragraph to the dra-ft G.R.

4. For clearness sake and to remove some redundancies in the present draft, I have re-drafted the G.R. and a typed copy is appended. There should be no delay in the issue of the G.R., considering the short time left for Mr. Collett to serve, and other details can be considered later.

Id/-
29-11-44.

Id/-
26-11-44.

A (E)

A(F)

H.E.(G.S.)

SBS.

(E.B.I).

A(R) had proposed that :-

(1) Mr. R.A.Collett should be granted pay at the rate of Rs. 2150 p.m. plus O.S.P. at Rs. 13-6-8 p.m.

and

(2) the designation of the new post should be "Public Health Engineer to Government" instead of "Superintending Engineer, Public Health" as proposed by this Dept.

These two proposals have been agreed to by A(F) and H.E. Necessary changes have accordingly been carried out in pencil in the G.R. at pp. 109-111 ante and will be inked in after approval.

2.(a) A(F) has also proposed that for the phrase "will have any claim to" occurring in para. 1(v) of the G.R. at p. 110 the phrase "of this Province will be permitted to apply for" should be substituted.

This change has also been carried out in pencil in the draft G.R. and will be inked in after approval.

(b) A consequential change, viz. change of the word "appointment" to "post" has also been made in para. 1(v) of the draft and is for approval.

3. A(R) has directed that there should be no delay in the issue of the G.R., vide para.4 of his note, dated the 26-11-44. It is proposed to issue advance copies of the G.R. to the "Public Health Engineer to Govt." the P.D. and the A.C., Bombay.

4.....

4. These papers may be submitted to A(R) before issue of the orders, vide p. 108 ante.

Id/-
6-12-44.

Id/-
6-12-44.

A(R) Jt. Secy. had also ~~kindly~~ better see as G.R. has been redrafted. He can return direct to P.W.D.

Jt. Secy. P.D.

Id/-
8-12-44.

Id/-
9-12-44.

P. W. D.

Reorganisation,

Advance copy. Public Health Branch of the Public Works Department.

Government of Bombay.

Public Works Department.

Resolution No. 7191/36.

Bombay Castle, 9th December 1944.

Read Government Resolution No. 6961/27, dated the 3rd February 1934.

Read Government Resolution No. 1731/36, dated the 12th April 1939.

Read letter No. 8155, dated the 6th August 1943, from the Consulting Public Health Engineer to Government.

Read letter No.C-6326, dated the 30th June 1944, from the Consulting Public Health Engineer to Government.

RESOLUTION:- In view of the general increase in the activities of the Public Health Branch and the greater importance of the works pertaining to public health, which are at present being undertaken, and more particularly those which will be undertaken in the post-war period, His Excellency the Governor of Bombay, in anticipation of the approval of His Excellency the Governor General, is pleased to direct that, in modification of the orders contained in Government Resolution No. 6961/27, dated the 3rd February 1934, in the Public Works Department:-

(i) The existing post of the Consulting Public Health Engineer to Government shall be replaced by a post in the General Provincial Service of a status corresponding to that of a Superintending Engineer in the Public Works Department.

The designation of this new post will be 'Public Health Engineer to Government'.

(ii) The scale of pay of the post will be Rs. 1750-100-2150, and if the holder of the post is of non-Asiatic domicile, he will be entitled to overseas pay at the rate of Rs. 13-6-8 per mensem in addition to the rupee grade pay admissible.

(iii).....

(iii) The post will be filled on a five year contract basis, in the first instance, subject to its termination by six months, notice on either side or earlier as provided in the agreement. The officer will be appointed on the terms and conditions embodied in the agreement which will be entered into by him with the Government of Bombay.

(iv) Mr. R.A.Collett, at present Consulting Public Health Engineer, should hold the new post until the date of his retirement and his pay should be Rs. 2150 per mensem in the scale of Rs. 1750-100-2150 and he should, in addition to his grade pay, be granted overseas pay at the rate of Rs.13-6-8.

(v) Mr. Collett's successor will be obtained by the appointment of an expert, whether by advertisement or by recruitment from the Army, and no officer of the I.S.E., B.S.E., Class I or B.S.E., Class II (including the old B.S.E.) of this Province will be permitted to apply for the post in question.

2. In modification of paragraph 3 of Government Resolution No. 6961/27, dated the 3rd February 1934, in the Public Works Department, the following duties are in future assigned to the Public Health Engineer to Government :-

(a) To act as Consulting Engineer to Government in connection with all Public Health Works which may be inaugurated by Government and to construct such works when required to do so;

(b) To scrutinise and report on all Public Health projects, prepared by outside agencies, which are submitted to Government for approval by local or outside bodies;

(c) When required and with the approval of Government, to act as Consulting Engineer to local and outside bodies in any Public Health matter and to construct Public Health Works for such bodies, subject to the terms laid down in paragraph 6 of that resolution.

3.....

3. (i) His Excellency the Governor of Bombay is further pleased to sanction with immediate effect the creation of a new divisional charge under the Public Health Engineer to Government. This divisional charge should be designated as the 'Public Health Works Division'.

(ii) One post of an Executive Engineer in the scale of pay corresponding to that of an Executive Engineer in the B.S.E. Class I, viz. Rs. 350-350-350-20-450-E.B.-30-660-EB-40-900 is sanctioned for the above division. This post will be included in the General Provincial Service under the Public Health Branch.

(iii) Mr. S.E.Wadia, B.E., temporary Deputy Engineer, is appointed to the charge as a purely temporary measure, pending reference to the Public Service Commission in regard to his suitability. His pay will be Rs. 350 per mensem in the scale referred to in (ii) above.

4. Order regarding the conversion of the Poona Water Works Sub-division into a divisional charge and in respect of other points arising from the above orders will issue in due course.

By order of the Governor of Bombay,

Sd/-
13-12-44.

(J. R. PHILLIPS)

Deputy Secretary to Government.

G.R.No.7191/36,P.W.D.,dated the 9th December 1944.

To

The Finance Department.

All other Departments of the Secretariat.

The Superintending Engineers of Circles.

The Electrical Engineer to Government.

The PUBLIC Health Engineer to Govt.

The Accountant General, Bombay (through the Finance Department).

The Executive Engineers of Divisions.

All other heads of offices under the several Departments of the Secretariat.

The.....

The Special Officer (Electric Grid).

The Director of Information.

No. of 1944.

Copy forwarded for information and guidance to

SDS.

O.O.No. 1 of 1945. Poona, January, 1st 1945.

Consequent on the re-organization of the -- Public Health Branch as per G.R., P.W.D.No.7191/36, dated the 9th of December 1944 and pending orders of Govt. reconstituting the Poona Water Works into a divisional charge, the following subdivisional and sectional charges will remain under the direct control of the Public Health Engineer to Govt.:-

	Officer in charge.
(1) Poona W.W.Sub-Division, Poona.	Mr. J.T.Gadre, B.E. Deputy Engineer.
(2) Hospital Town W.S.Sub-Dn., Kirkee.	Mr. V.K.Majgaonkar, B.E.(Mech.)B.S.E., Asstt. Engineer.
(3) Dapuri Sub-Division, Dapuri.	Rao Saheb R.B.Chitnis, B.E.(Mech.) A.M.I.M.E.(lond.) (Ind.).
(4) Boring Works Section.	Mr. V.K.Vataraj, Boring Dy. Engineer.

2. The construction works in progress at Sholapur and Visapur which were supervised by Mr. V.K. Majgaonkar, Assistant Engineer are transferred to the Hospital Town Water Supply Sub-Division for execution.

Sd/- R. A. Collett
Public Health Engineer
to the Govt. of Bombay.

No.12987 of 1945.
Poona, January, 1st 1945.

Copy f.w.c. for information to -

(1) The Secretary to Government, Public Works Deptt. Bombay.
(2) The Accountant General, Bombay.
(3) The Executive Engineer, Public Health Wks. Division, Poona.

Sd/-

Public Health Engineer

to the Govt. of Bombay.

Office Order No. 10 of 1945.

Poona, January 1st 1945.

With the opening up of a new divisional charge - "Public Health Works Division" - under Mr. S. B. Wadia, Temporary Deputy Engineer, now appointed as Executive Engineer under the administrative control of the Public Health Engineer toGovernment as per orders of Government contained in G.R.,P.W.D. No.7191/36, dated the 9th December 1944, the following Sub-Divisional and Sectional charges are hereby transferred to the control of the Executive Engineer, Public Health Works Division, Poona, with effect from the formation of the new Division, viz. 2nd January 1945:-

	Officer in charge.
(1) Sanitary Project Sub-Dn., Poona.	Mr. V.B.Sathe, B.E. Temp. Deputy Engineer (vide office order No.1 A dated 1-1-45).
(2) Ambernath Water Supply Sub-Dn., Badlapur.	Mr. S.B.Sathe, B.E.
(3) Sewage Pumping Station, Bahiroba, Poona.	Mr. Gulam Mohomed, Superintendent, - Sectional Officer.

The following works in progress will remain under the control of the Executive Engineer, Public Health Works Division, Poona:-

(1) Improvements to Nasik Water Supply Scheme.

(2) Poona Cantonment Drainage Scheme.

Sd/- R.A. Collett.
Public Health Engineer
to the Govt. of Bombay.

No.12990 of 1945....

No. 12950 of 1945.

Poona, January, 1st 1945.

Copy forwarded, with compliments, for information to -

The Secretary to Government, Public Health Department, Bombay.

The Accountant General, Bombay.

The Executive Engineer, Public Health Works Division, Poona.

Sd/-

Public Health Engineer

to the Govt. of Bombay.

Nil

3.1

Letter.

From

R. A. Collet, Esquire, M.B.E., F.R.San.I.,
Public Health Engineer to the
Govt. of Bombay, Poona.

To

The Secretary to Government,
Public Works Department, Bombay.

No. 177 of 1945. Poona, January, 5th 1945.

Subject:-Reorganization of the
Public Health Branch of the P.W.D.

Reference: G.R., P.W.D.No.7191/36. dated the 9th December 1944.

2. In accordance with the orders of Government contained in para 3 thereof, Mr. Vadia has formed the "Public Health Works Division" from the 2nd of January 1945. I have relieved him of his Sub-Divisional charges by posting Messrs. V.K.Majgaonkar, Assistant Engineer and V.[illegible].Sathe, Temporary Deputy Engineeer to the Hospital Town Water Supply Sub-Division (to be renamed as Kirkee Water Supply Sub-Division - proposals for which are before Government) and the Sanitary Project Sub-Divisions respectively. I have proposed that the new Executive Engineer, Public Health Works Division, should have under his control the following two sub-divisions:-

(1) Ambernath Water Supply Sub-Division.

(2) Sanitary Project Sub-Division.

(Copies of the office orders have been separately endorsed to Government).

3. In addition to my own duties as Public Health Engineer to Government, I am temporarily retaining control of the following sub-divisions directly under me:-

(1) Poona Water Works Sub-Division.

(2) Dapuri Workshops Sub-Division.

(3)[illegible]

(3) Hospital Town Water Supply Sub-Division.

(4) Boring Works.

[illegible] for purposes of accounts I will also function [illegible] a Divisional Officer until such time as the [illegible] Poona Water Works Division is formed. As [illegible] still continue to retain the drawing power of [illegible] Executive Engineer, I am not having any [illegible] separate Imprest as Superintending Engineer. [illegible] accounts will, therefore, be continued [illegible] to be sent to Accountant General, as Public [illegible] Health Engineer to Government in respect of [illegible] Sub-Divisions whose control I have retained.

4. I have under me two divisional accou[illegible]nts posted by the Accountant General. Sub[illegible]ject to his approval, I am asking one of them [illegible] work in the newly opened Public Health Works [illegible]; the other will continue to work under me.

5. Government have not yet fixed the [illegible]rength and pay scales of the different esta[illegible]blishments to be posted under the new offices [illegible] I will submit my proposals to Government [illegible]ortly. Pending receipt of Government [illegible]nction to the strength and scales of pay [illegible] the estt. of the office of the Public [illegible]ealth Engineer to Government and that of [illegible]visions, I have already filled up the posts [illegible] my head clerk, first clerk and Head Drafts[illegible]an, as these posts carry heavy responsibility.

Sd/-

Public Health Engineer to the

Government of Bombay.

[illegible].Nil

[illegible] 3. Copy to

Copy forwarded with compliments to

the.....

the Accountant General, Bombay, with a request to kindly confirm the arrangements proposed in para 4 of my letter. Mr. Kunchur has been asked to work as as Divisional Accountant in the Public Health Works Division and Mr. G.S.Ranade will continue to work as Divisional Accountant attached to my office. The accounts of my branch will hereafter be sent in two groups - one for Public Health Works Division and the other for the Publi Health Engineer to Government - separately.

O.O.No. 16 of 1945. Poona, January 9th 1945.

In partial modification of the orders issued in this office order No.1-C dated the 1st January 1945 P. & R. to Nasik Water Works and the scheme of Improvements to Nasik Water Supply wil remain directly under the control of the undersigned, as this work was specially handed over to me by Government for completion.

2. Mr. S. S. Sathe, S.D.O., Ambernath Water Supply Sub-Division should exercise general supervision over these works.

Sd/- R. A. Collett
Public Health Engineer
to the Govt. of Bombay.

No.343 of 1945.

Poona, Jany. 9th 1945.

Copy f.w.c. for information to -

(1) The Secretary to Government, P.W.D., Bombay.
(2) The Accountant General, Bombay.
(3) The Executive Engineer, Public Health Works Divn., Poona, (with a spare copy for the Ambernath Sub-Division).

Sd/-
Public Health Engineer
to the Govt. of Bombay.

D.A.:-Nil
RNS 9.

7191/36

No.7191/36-E(I) P.W.D.

B.C., 16th Jany. 1945.

Separately to each.

To

The Registrar,
H.M's High Court of Judicature
Appellate Side, Bombay.

The Prothonotary and Senior Master
H.M's High Court of Judicature
Original Side, Bombay.

Subject:-Reorganisation of the P.H.Br. of the P.W.D.

Sir,

I am directed to forward for the information of the H on'ble the Chief Justice and Judges of the High Court, a copy of G.R.No.7191/36, dated the 9-12-44, on the subject noted above.

Your obedient servant,

Sd/-
13-1-45

Sd/-
17-1-45.

D.A.- Copy of the G.
R. refd. to.

The P.S.C.wants to know as to why that body was not consulted before the appointment of Mr. R.A.Collett to the post of the P.W.Engr. to Govt. sanctioned in G.R.No. 7191/36, dated the 9th Decr. 1944, was made.

2. Sub section 3 of section 266 of the G.of I. Act 1935 lays down, inter alia, that the P.S.C. shall be consulted on the principles to be followed in making appointments to Civil Services and posts and in making promotions and transfers from one service to another and on the suitability of candidates for such appointments, promotions and transfers. In view, however, the P.& S.D.Notification No.1763/34, dated the 1st April 1943, it is not necy. to consult the Commission in respect of tempy. appointments the duration of which will not exceed for more than one year.

3. Mr.R.A.Collett, was holding the post of the C.P.H.E. to Govt. until its status was raised to that of a Superintending Engr. The apptt. of Mr.Collett to the post of the P.W.Engr. to Govt. is purely a tempy. arrangement, vide para 8(a) of A(R)'s note dated the 4th Aug. 1944. Mr. Collett's successor will be appointed as explained in para. 1(V) of G.R.No.7191/36, dated the 9th December 1944. Please see in this connection para. 5 of the Office Note dated the 14th Oct.1944.

4. The presumption made by the Commission in para. 2 of its letter under disposal is correct. That body will be informed accordingly.

5. The P.S.C.may, if approved, be informed as per draft put up which may be refd. u.o. to the P.& S.D.before submission.

6. The question of the formation of the Poona Water....

Water Works Dn. and of the selection of an officer to hold the post of the Ex.Engr., Poona Water Works Dn. has been taken up separately in file No.7147/36. Similarly the question of the non-gazetted posts which will be required by the P.H.Engr. to Govt. for the re-organised offices has been taken up in file No. 7191/36(II).

7. The outstanding questions in this file are :-

(i) Addressing the P.H.Engr. to Govt. for a suitable advertisement for the post of the P.H. Engr. to Govt.

(ii) Addressing the P.S.C.as regards the suitability of Mr.Wadia for the post of the Ex.Engr. P.H.Works Dn.

Necessary action on these questions will be taken up hereafter.

Id. S.A.J.
20/2/45.

Id. R.H.H.
22/2/45

P.A G.D.

Seen and returned to the P.W.D.

Id. B.K.P.
1/3/45.

Id.
1/3/45
U.S.

U.O.R. to the P.W.D., dt. 1st March 1945.

Confidential
No. 7191/36-S(I).

P. W. Daptt.
Bombay Castle, 7th March 1946.

To

The Secretary,
Bombay-Sind Public Service Commission.

Subject:- Appointment of Mr. R.A.Collett as P.H.Engineer to Government.

...

With reference to para 1 of your letter No.757/8504, dated the 22nd January 1946 on the subject mentioned above, I am directed to address you as follows:-

(i) the post of the C.P.H.E.to Govt. created in 1934 was of the status of an Ex.Engr. in the P.W.D.and the duties assigned to it were purely consultative. Since then the nature of the work, has changed from that of purely consultative to both executive and consultative.

(ii) Government has been satisfied that, for a long time the C.P.H.E.to Government was handicapped by insufficient status and powers. In view of the general increase in the activities of the Public Health Branch and the greater importance of works pertaining to the P.H., more particularly those which will be undertaken in the post-war period, His Excellency the Governor has decided that the then existing post of the C.P.H.E.to Govt. which was held by Mr. Collett, should be replaced by the post of a status corresponding to that of an S.E.in the P.W.D.as it used to be before 1934.

(iii) It will necessarily take some time to appoint an outsider to the post of the P.H.Engr. to Government as the appointment to the post has to be made as directed by Govt. in para 1(v) of G.R.No.7191/36, dated the 9th Decr. 1944, and in consultation with the P.S.C. It was accordingly decided to continue the services of Mr.R.A.Collett who has the necessary qualifications to discharge the duties of the new post, viz., the P.H.Engineer to Government in a purely temporary capacity and pending the appointment of his successor. As the appointment was of a purely temporary nature the P.S.C.was not consulted vide para 1(b) of

P.& S.D.Notification No.1763/34, dated the 1st April 1943.

2. The presumption made in para 2 of your letter under disposal is confirmed.

Id. W.H.E.C.
22/2/46.

Urgent.

U.O.to P.& S.D. dated the 22-2-45.

Issued on 8-3-46.

P.W.D.

E.E.(I).

The P.& S.D.having agreed the draft on pp. 133-134 may now issued, if approved.

Id. W.H.E.C.
5/3/46.

A(R)

Id. C.C.
6/3/45.

E.E.(I).

P.W.D.

Submitted with ref. to para 8 of the O.N., dated the 14-10-44.

2. Secy. draft to the P.S.C.re: Mr.Wadia's suitability for the post of the Ex.Engr., P.H.Works Dn.,is put up for approval. A(R) may see before issue.

Id.
11/7/45.

Id.
12/7/45.
Secy.(I)

(I do not understand how this appointment ~~xxx~~ comes up 7 months after the appointment was made. The O.N.in question saying it would require acquiscence of the P.S.C.is dated 14th Oct.1944. Surely the P.S.C.will question the delay).

Id.
12/7/45.
A(R).

Confdl.

No. 7191/36-E(I). P. W. Deptt., B.C., 17th July 1945.

To

The Secy.,
Bombay-Sind Public Service Commission.

Subject:- Reorganisation of the P.H.Branch
Apptt. of Mr.S.E.Wadia, B.E.,
as Ex.Engr.

I am to forward a copy of G.R., P.W.D., No. 7191/36, dated the 9-12-44 and to refer to para. 3 thereof in which Mr.S.E.Wadia, B.E., tempy. Dy.Engr., was appointed to hold charge of the P.H.Works Dn.as a purely temporary ~~measure~~ measure.

2. Prior to this appointment as Ex.Engr., P.H.W.Dn., Mr.Wadia was a tempy. Dy.Engr. in the General Provl. Service. His apptt. to the post of the tempy.Dy.Engr. was acquiesced in by the Comm., vide your letter No. 711, dated the 11-10-43. Mr. Wadia has been appointed to the post of Ex.Engr. on account of his qualifications and specialised knowledge of the P.H.Works.

3. I am, therefore, to request that this letter may be placed before the Commission and their approval obtained to the appointment of Mr.S.E.Wadia as Ex.Engr., P.H.Works Dn. Mr. Wadia's personal register is sent herewith.

D.A.-Copy of G.R.and One personal register.

Id. 16/7/45.

Id. 16/7/45. Secy.(I).

Issued with G.R.
Id.
18/7/45.

7191/38
25638

S.B.(I). Public Works Department.

The Commission desires to know whether there were any officers senior to Mr.S.E.Wadia in the P.H. Circle at the date of his promotion and if there were, the reasons for their supersession.

2. At the time of Mr.Wadia's appointment as Ex.Engr., P.H.Works Divn. (2-1-45), the following officers in the P.H.Circle were senior to him:-

Name of the Officer.	Name of service.	Date of apptt.in his respective service.	Apptt. and rank.
1. Mr.V.R.Marathe, B.E.(Mechl.), C.I.Mech.E.	General Provl.Service corresponding to that of an Asstt.Engr.in the B.S.E.Class I.	14th September 1939.	Mechl.Asstt.in the office of the P.H.E.to Govt.
2.Mr.V.K.Majgaonkar,B.E.(Mechl.)	B.S.E.	1st November 1930.	Attached to the office of the P.H.Engr.to Govt.
3.Mr.M.M.Vyas, B.E.	B.S.E.(II).	13th March 1940.	
4.Mr.R.B.Chitnis, B.E.(Mech.), A.M.I.Mech.E. (Lond.),A.M.I.E. (Ind.).	General Provl.Service corresponding to that of a Dy.Engr.in the B.S.E.Class II (Tempy.).	1st December 1938.	S.D.O.,Dapuri Workshops Sub-Division.

3. Pl. see the Secy.(I)'s note, dated the 26-9-44. Mr.Majgaonkar was ruled out for the Ex.Engr.'s post for the reasons stated at 'A' on p. 75 ante. Mr.Vyas was not actually serving in the P.H.Circle at the time of Mr.Wadia's promotion, having been deputed to the College of Engrg. Poona, as Lecturer. He was not, however, considered fit to hold an Executive charge because he was an extremely junior. Mr.Vyas had also represented in this connection and he was replied to as in Govt. Letter No.2930/36-E(I), dated the 26th June 1945.

But no discussion appears to have taken place with regard to the claims of Messrs. V.R.Marathe and R.B. Chitnis.

4. In the circumstances, it is for consideration what...

what reply may be given to the Commission.

Id.
10/8/45.

The reply is surely quite and obvious.

(1) Mr.Marathe has only Mechanical Knowledge, whilst the appointment requires a Civil Engineer.

(2) Mr. Majgaonkar, a failure.

(3) Mr. Vyas, not considered suitable and away at the College. He should only be included in the list if it is considered necessary to do so since he is on deputation to the College and belongs to the normal B.S.E.II. On his reversion he may not return to the P.H.Circle.

R/S. Chitnis is purely Mechanical and has put in the whole of his service i/c Depuri Workshop quite unsuitable for the appointment in question.

A careful draft should be put up explaining clearly that whilst these 3 officers are senior to Mr.Wadia, they do not hold the qualifications necessary for the post in question, being purely Mechanical Engineer would a purely Civil Engineer is required, they have each been appointed specially for the posts they hold and are not therefore superceded in the true sense.

Id.
11/8/45
Secy.(I).

E.E.(I). P.W.D.

Resubmitted with a draft for approval and submission.

2. It is not necy. to include Mr.M.H.Vyas among the Officers superseded by Mr.Wadia as Mr.Vyas was away at the Col.of Engrg.,Poona, at the time of Mr.Wadia's apptt. as Ex.Engr.

Id.
25/8/45.

Id.
27/8/45
Secy.(I).

Id.
27/8/45
Ch.Secy.

Id.
28/8/45
A(R).

CONFIDENTIAL.
No. 7191/36-E(I).

P. W. D.
B.C., 29th Aug.1945.

To

The Secretary,
Bombay-Sind Public Service Commission.

Subject:- Re-organization of the Public Health Branch:
Appointment of Mr.S.E.Wadia, B.E., as Ex. Engr.

With reference to your letter No.790/420, dated the 3-8-45, I am directed to state that the following officers in the P.H.Circle were senior to Mr.S.E.Wadia at the time of his apptt. as Ex.Engr., P.H.Works Divn.(i.e. on the 2-1-45):-

Name of the officer.	Post held.
1.Mr.V.R.Marathe, B.E.(Mechl.), G.I.Mech.E. (General Provl.Service corresponding to that of an Asstt. Engr.in the B.S.E.Class I).	Mechl.Asstt. in the office of the P.H.E. to Govt.
2. Mr.V.K.Majgaonkar, B.E.(Mechl.), B.S.E.	Attached to the office of the P.H.Engr. to Govt.
3. Rao Sahib R.B.Chitnis,B.E. (Mech.),A.M.I.Mech.E.(Lond), A.M.I.E.(Ind.) (Genl.Provl.Service corresponding to that of a Dy.Engr. in the B.S.E.Class II).	S.D.O., Dapuri Workshops Sub-Divn.

These Officers have been superseded for the following reasons:-

(1) Mr.V.R.Marathe has only Mechl.knowledge whilst the post of the Ex.Engr., P.H.Works Divn., to which Mr.S.E. Wadia has been appointed requires a Civil Engr.

(2) Mr.V.K.Majgaonkar has not the qualifications required of an Ex.Engr. He is moreover only a Mechl.Engr.

(3) Rao Sahib R.B.Chitnis is a purely Mechl.Engr. and has put in the whole of his service in the Dapuri Workshops. He is, therefore, quite unsuitable for the post in question.

I am to add that whilst the three officers mentioned above are senior to Mr.S.E.Wadia, they do not possess the qualifications necessary for the post of the Ex.Engr., P.H.Works Divn., being purely Mechl.Engrs. The post

can....

can be suitably filled in only by a Civil Engr. with experience of P.H.Works. Mr. Wadia was accordingly appointed to the post after taking into consideration the qualifications and claims of the three officers mentioned above who have been appointed specially for the posts they hold and in the opinion of this Govt. cannot be considered as having been superseded ~~by~~ in the true sense.

2. I am accordingly to request you to place this letter before the Commission and obtain their approval to the apptt. of Mr.S.K.Wadia as Ex.Engr., P.H. Works Divn.

3. The personal files of Mr.V.R.Marathe and R/S. R.B.Chitnis accompany. That of Mr. Majgaonker will be sent separately.

D.A.-2 personal files.

Id. R.H.M.
27/2/46
Secy.(I).

Id.
25/2/46.

4
YMW.
29/2/56.

S.R. (I)

7191/36
29685

Submitted with reference to Govt. letter No.7191/36-S(I), dated the 7-7-45.

2. The Public Service Commission has acquiesced in the proposal to appoint Mr. S.K.Wadia, B.E. as Ex. Engr., Public Health Works Divn. A draft Notifn. appointing Mr.Wadia as Ex. Engr., P.H.Works Divn. is put up for approval along with a draft endt.

3. In G.R.No.7147/36, dated the 30-6-45, orders have been issued appointing, inter alia, Mr. J.F.Gadre as Ex. Engr., Poona Water Works Divn. In para 3 of the G.R., Govt has directed that an agreement should be obtained from Mr. Gadre in the form appended to the same.

The two divnl.charges, viz. the Poona Water Works Divn. and the Public Health Works Divn.are permanent charges in the Public Health Branch and the posts of these Ex.Engrs. are included in the General Provl.Service. It, therefore, appears that conditions of service in the case of the two officers should be similar.

4. It is accordingly for orders whether in the case of Mr. Wadia, the Public Health Engr. to Govt. may be requested to obtain from Mr.Wadia similar agreement as in the case of Mr. Gadre and forward it to Govt. for execution.

If so necessary further action in this connection will be taken hereafter.

Id
12-9-45

Ch.Secy.
A(R)

Margion
Id
12/9/45

Id
13/9/45

Id
13/9/45

Id
14/9/45.

xxx

7191/36
29685

(Below copy of P.& S.Deptt.(P.W.) Notifn. No.7191/36, dated the 17th Sept. 1945.)

No.7191/36-B(I) Public Works Deptt.,
B.C., 19th Sept.1945.

Copy forwarded to-

the Public Health Engr. to Govt.,

the A.G., Bombay,

the Ex.Engr., Public Health works Divn.,

S.K.Vadia, Esq., B.E., Ex.Engr., Public Health Works Divn.,

for information and guidance in continuation of G.R. No.7191/36, dated the 9-12-44.

Id 19/9

EEP. 12/9/45

By the order of the Govr. of Bombay,

Id 12-9-45

Id 12/9/45

7191/36
1945

No.7191/36.
P.& H.Deptt.(P.W.)
Council Hall, Poona, 17th Sept. 1945.

NOTIFICATION.

The Govt. of Bombay is pleased to direct that Mr.S.K. Vadia, B.E., who was appointed as Ex.Engr., Public Health Works Divn. as a purely temporary measure with effect from the 2-1-45, should continue to hold that post until further orders.

By order of the Govt. of Bombay,

N.T.Sarlaya

Chief Secy to Govt.

MP.
12/9/45

Jd
12-9-45

Jd
12/9/45

no to P.& H.D. date 15th Sept.1945.

No.7191/36-E(I) Letter. Public Works Department,
B.C., 24th Sept. 1945.

To

The Public Health Engr. to Govt.

Subject:- Agreement of Mr.S.K.Wadia, B.E., Ex. Engr., Public Health Works Divn.

Reference: Govt.Notifn., P.& S.Deptt.(P.W.) No.7191/36, dated the 17-9-45.

2. Mr.S. K. Wadia, B.E., Ex.Engr., Public Health Works Divn. is an officer of the General Provincial Service. He has accordingly to enter into an agreement with Govt. as has been done in the case of Mr. J.T.Sadre, B.E., Ex.Engr., Poona Water Works Divn. You are requested to obtain from Mr. Wadia an agreement, in duplicate, on stamped paper of the value of Rupee one and annas eight, similar to the one printed as an accompt. to G.R.No.7187/36, dated the 30th June 1945 (With suitable changes where necessary), and submit the same to Govt. for execution. The agreement should be signed by Mr. Wadia but not dated. It will be signed by the Secy. to the Govt. of Bombay, P.W.D. and dated. The duplicate & one copy of the agreement will thereafter be returned to Mr. Wadia.

25/9/45 MKP. 21/9/45.

By order of the Govr. of Bombay,

Id
22-9-45.

D.A.-Nil.

Id
22/9/45

L.T.J.
19/5/56.

The Post war Sanitary Sub-division was created onderto prepare plans and estimates for the Neeranger and Belgaum Water Supply Projects. It was also decided to entrust to this sub-divn. the work of investigating and preparing water supply and drainage schemes in the Southern Circle. In G.R. No.7191/36, dated the 5-4-45, the Headquarters of the Post War Sanitary Sub-divn. have been fixed to be at Belgaum. The formation of the sub-division could not be undertaken immediately after the approval of the Govt. because no Dy. Engr. was available to fill up that post. Subsequently two Deputy Engrs. were appointed vide G.L., P.W.D. No. 6369/36-2 (1) dated 19th Septr. 1945 and the formation of the sub-division was taken up. However, the Public Health Engineer requested the Govt. to retain the Headquarters of the Sub-division temporarily at Poona for the following reasons:-

i) The difficulty in getting suitable accommodation at Belgaum.

ii) By retaining the sub.division in Poona for sometime it would be possible for the Executive Engineer to acquaint the sub-divisional officer with the nature of work required to be done by him in the subedivision.

andiii) the prevalence of plague at Belgaum.

The Public Health Engineer's Proposal was accepted and the Headquarters of the Post-War sanitary Sub-divn. was fixed at Poona till the 31st March 1946. A further extension upto 30-9-46 was accorded to the retention of the Headquarters, as the position as regards accommodation at Belgaum had not been eased.

The P.H.Engineer in his fresh letter at page 181 ante, reports that the position as

regds suitable accommodation for the sub-divn. at Belgaum has not improved. The shifting of the headquarters of the sub-division to Belgaum is essential as it is proposed to entrust to this sub-division both post-war and other schemes of investigations in the Southern Circle. The P.M. Engr. has stated in his letter that the correspondence with the Military Authorities and the owner of one building No. 21 is still going on. In view of this, F.D. may not disagree with P.W.D. proposal to allow the P.M.Engr. to retain the H.Q. of the post-war Sanitary Sub-divin. at Poona to the end of March 1947. It is presumed that early efforts will be made to shift the headquarters to Belgaum.

Id
19/11/46

Id
20/11

S.E. to the P.W.D. dated 20-11-1946.

S.E.(I)

Id
21/11
P.W.D

Submitted with reference to this Deptt. note dated the 11/11/46.

2. The F.D. having agreed to this Deptt's proposal, the draft within may issue, as modified in pencil. It does not seem a necessary to submit the papers to H.M.P.W.D.

Id
25/11/46

Urgent.

To

The Secretary to Government,

Public Works Department, Bombay.

No.M.S.21.27-B/173 of 1947. Poona, January 11th 1947.

Subject:- Reorganisation of the Public Health Branch - Headquarters of the Post War Sanitary Sub-Division.

******

Reference Correspondence ending With Government letter, P.W.D., No. 7191/36-E(I), dated the 26th November 1946.

2. All attempts to secure a building at Belgaum for the Sanitary Sub-Division have failed. Even enquiries made recently go to show that neither a Government or Private building will be available for the purpose in the near future. For this reason and also in the interest of work, I suggest that the headquarters of the above sub-division be fixed at Dharwar. This will be convenient to make preliminary arrangements in connection with Hoorzagar Water Supply Scheme which is likely to come up for execution immediately and also to attend to survey works in a whole of Karnatak, Dharwar being a central place. A detailed report received from the Executive Engineer, Public Health Works Division, is this connection is attached for the information of Government. I, therefore, request that Government sanction may kindly be accorded to the headquarters of the Post War Sanitary Sub-Division being shifted to Dharwar instead of to Belgaum.

Id

Encl: 1 Copy of letter.
IRV.9.1

Public Health Engineer
to the Govt. of Bombay.

P. W. D.

E.E.(I)

Submitted with reference to G.L. No.7191/36-E (I), dated the 26th Nov. 1946.

The P.H.E. to Govt. states that it is not possible to

secure a building at Belgaum as the H.Q. for the Post-War Sanitary Sub-Dion. The P.H.E. therefore recommends that because of the above reason and also in the interest of work the H.Q. of the sub-divn. should be fixed at Dharwar instead of Belgaum. It is for orders whether the hon. P.H.E.'s request may be gen. granted in u.o. consultation with the F.D.

F.D.

There P.W.R.D., M.B.A B.B.

Id
22-1-47

Id
17/1/47

P.W.R.
24/1/47

u.o. to the F.D. dt of 24th Jan. 1947

Finance Dept. P.W.R.

The P.W.R. proposal may be accepted.

Id
13/1

Id
30-1-47

u-o-r to P.W.D. dt of 31-1-47

Id
13/1/47
Urgent.

No.7191/36-I-E(I) Letter. P.W.D.

B.G. 12th Feb. 1947.

To

The P.W.E. to Govt.

Subject: Post-War Sanitary Sub-Div.

Reference: Your letter No.W.S.21.27-B179, dated the 11th Jan. 1947.

2. The headquarters of the Post-War Sanitary Sub-Divn., at Poona, should be moved to Dharwar, with effect from the 1-4-47, instead of to Belgaum, as directed in G.L.No. ~~7191/36~~ 7191/36-E(I), dated the 26th Nov. 1946.

By order etc.

DA N.C

Copy forwarded to :

the F.D.,

the C.E., P.W.D.,

the S.E., P.C.,

the A.C.Bombay (thro' the F.D.)

for information, with reference to G.L.No.7191/36-E(I), dated the 26th Nov. 1946.

M
5/2/47